



OHIO AUDITOR OF STATE
KEITH FABER



OHIO AUDITOR OF STATE KEITH FABER



88 East Broad Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215
ContactUs@ohioauditor.gov
(800) 282-0370

INDEPENDENT ACCOUNTANT'S REPORT ON APPLYING AGREED-UPON PROCEDURES

Hubbard Township
Trumbull County
2600 Elmwood Drive Ext.
Hubbard, Ohio 44425-9707

We have performed the procedures enumerated below on the Hubbard Township's (the Township) receipts, disbursements and balances recorded in the cash basis accounting records for the years ended December 31, 2022 and 2021 and certain compliance requirements related to those transactions and balances, included in the information provided to us by the management of the Township. The Township is responsible for the receipts, disbursements and balances recorded in the cash basis accounting records for the years ended December 31, 2022 and 2021 and certain compliance requirements related to these transactions and balances included in the information provided to us by the Township.

The Board of Trustees and the management of the Township have agreed to and acknowledged that the procedures performed are appropriate to meet the intended purpose of providing assistance in the evaluation of the Township's receipts, disbursements and balances recorded in their cash-basis accounting records for the years ended December 31, 2022 and 2021, and certain compliance requirements related to these transactions and balances. No other party acknowledged the appropriateness of the procedures. This report may not be suitable for any other purpose. The procedures performed may not address all the items of interest to a user of the report and may not meet the needs of all users of the report and, as such, users are responsible for determining whether the procedures performed are appropriate for their purposes. The sufficiency of the procedures is solely the responsibility of the parties specified in the report. Consequently, we make no representation regarding the sufficiency of the procedures described below either for the purpose for which this report has been requested or for any other purpose.

For the purposes of performing these procedures, this report only describes exceptions exceeding \$10.

The procedures and the associated findings are as follows:

Cash

1. We recalculated the December 31, 2022 and December 31, 2021 bank reconciliations. We found no exceptions.
2. We agreed the January 1, 2021 beginning fund balances for each fund recorded in the Fund Ledger Report to the December 31, 2020 balances in the prior year documentation in the prior year Agreed-Upon Procedures working papers. We found no exceptions. We also agreed the January 1, 2022 beginning fund balances for each fund recorded in the Fund Ledger Report to the December 31, 2021 balances in the Fund Ledger Report. We found no exceptions.
3. We agreed the 2022 and 2021 Bank Reconciliation as of December 31, 2022 and 2021 to the total fund cash balances reported in the Fund Status Report and the financial statements filed by the Township in the Hinkle System. The amounts agreed.

4. We confirmed the December 31, 2022 bank account balance with the Ohio Pooled Collateral System. We found no exceptions. We also agreed the confirmed balances to the amounts appearing in the December 31, 2022 bank reconciliation without exception.
5. We selected five reconciling debits (such as outstanding checks) from the December 31, 2022 bank reconciliation:
 - a. We traced each debit to the subsequent January and February bank statements. We found no exceptions.
 - b. We traced the amounts and dates to the check register, and determined the debits were dated prior to December 31. We found no exceptions.

Property Taxes, Intergovernmental and Other Confirmable Cash Receipts

1. We selected a total of five receipts from the *Statement of Semiannual Apportionment of Taxes*, State Distribution Transaction Lists (DTL), and the Trumbull County Vendor History Reports for 2022 and a total of five from 2021:
 - a. We compared the amount from the above named reports to the amount recorded in the Receipt Register Report. The amounts agreed.
 - b. We inspected the Receipt Register Report to determine these receipts were allocated to the proper fund(s) as required by Ohio Rev. Code §§ 5705.05-.06 and 5705.10. We found no exceptions.
 - c. We inspected the Receipt Register Report to determine whether the receipt was recorded in the proper year. The receipt was recorded in the proper year. We found no exceptions.
2. We inspected the Receipt Register Report to determine whether it included two real estate tax receipts plus advances for 2022 and 2021. The Receipt Register Report included the proper number of tax receipts for each year. We found no exceptions.
3. We confirmed the total amount paid from OPWC to the Township during 2022 and 2021 with the RT Vernal Paving, Shelly and Sands Inc, and Mahoning County Engineer. We found no exceptions.
 - a. We inspected the Receipt Register Report to determine whether these receipts were allocated to the proper fund(s). We found no exceptions.
 - b. We inspected the Receipt Register Report to determine whether the receipts were recorded in the proper year. We found no exceptions.

Debt

1. From the prior agreed-upon procedures documentation, we observed the following lease was outstanding as of December 31, 2020.
 - a. This amount agreed to the Township's January 1, 2021 balances on the summary we used in procedure 3.

Issue	Principal outstanding as of December 31, 2020:
Lease	\$12,810

2. We inquired of management and inspected the Receipt Register Report and Payment Register Detail Report for evidence of debt issued during 2022 or 2021 or debt payment activity during 2022 or 2021. There were no new debt issuances, nor any debt payment activity during 2022 or 2021.

3. We obtained a summary of lease activity for 2022 and 2021 and agreed principal and interest payments from the related debt amortization schedule to debt service fund payments reported in the Payment Register Detail Report. We also compared the date the debt service payments were due to the date the Township made the payments. We found no exceptions.

Payroll Cash Disbursements

1. We selected one payroll check for five employees from 2022 and one payroll check for five employees from 2021 from the Wage Withholdings Detail Report and:
 - a. We compared the hours and pay rate, or salary recorded in the Wage Detail Report to supporting documentation (timecard, legislatively or statutorily-approved rate or salary). We found no exceptions.
 - b. We inspected the fund and account codes to which the check was posted to determine the posting was allowable based on the employees' duties as documented in the employees' personnel files. We found no exceptions.
 - c. We confirmed the payment was posted to the proper year. We found no exceptions.
2. We selected three new employees and Board of Trustees from 2022 and three employees and Board of Trustees from 2021 and:
 - a. We inspected the employees' personnel files for the Retirement system, Federal, State & Local income tax withholding authorization.
 - b. We agreed the items in a above to the Employee General Information Report. We found no exceptions.
3. We inspected the last remittance of tax and retirement withholdings for the year ended December 31, 2022 to confirm remittances were timely paid, and if the amounts paid agreed to the amounts withheld, plus the employer's share where applicable, during the final withholding period of 2022. We observed the following:

Withholding (plus employer share, where applicable)	Date Due	Date Paid	Amount Due	Amount Paid
Federal income taxes & Medicare (and social security, for employees not enrolled in pension system)	January 31, 2023	1/6/23	\$2,801.70	\$2,801.70
State income taxes	January 15, 2023	12/28/22	\$2,310.73	\$2,310.73
Local income tax	January 31, 2023	12/28/22	\$224.81	\$224.81
OPERS retirement	January 30, 2023	1/20/23	\$22,606.76	\$22,606.76

We found no exceptions.

4. We compared total gross pay for the fiscal officer and each board of trustee for 2022 and 2021 to the compensation permitted by Ohio Revised Code §§ 507.09 and 505.24, respectively. Their pay did not exceed the Ohio Revised Code §§ 507.09 and 505.24 permitted amounts.
5. We inquired of management and inspected the Payment Register Detail Report for the years ended December 31, 2022 and 2021 to determine if township employees and/or trustees were reimbursed for out-of-pocket insurance premiums. Insurance reimbursements made were in compliance with Ohio Rev. Code §§ 505.60, 505.601, 505.602 and 505.603 and federal regulations.

Non-Payroll Cash Disbursements

1. We selected 10 disbursements from the Payment Register Detail Report for the year ended December 31, 2022 and 10 from the year ended 2021 and determined whether:
 - a. The disbursements were for a proper public purpose. We found no exceptions.
 - b. The check number, date, payee name and amount recorded on the returned, canceled check agreed to the check number, date, payee name and amount recorded in the Payment Register Detail Report and to the names and amounts on the supporting invoices. We found no exceptions.
 - c. The payment was posted to a fund consistent with the restricted purpose for which the fund's cash can be used. We found no exceptions.
 - d. The fiscal officer certified disbursements requiring certification or issued a *Then and Now Certificate*, as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 5705.41(D). We found no exceptions.

Compliance – Budgetary

1. Ohio Rev. Code § 5705.41(B) prohibits expenditures (disbursements plus certified commitments) from exceeding appropriations. We compared total expenditures to total approved appropriations (Ohio Rev. Code §§ 5705.38 and 5705.40) plus any carryover appropriations for the years ended December 31, 2022 and 2021 for the General, Gasoline Tax and Light Fund as recorded in the Appropriation Status Report. Expenditures did not exceed appropriations.
2. We inspected the Cash Summary by Fund Report for the years ended December 31, 2022 and 2021 for negative cash fund balances. Ohio Rev. Code § 5705.10 (I) provides that money paid into a fund must be used for the purposes for which such fund is established. As a result, a negative fund cash balance indicates that money from one fund was used to cover the expenses of another. No funds had a negative cash fund balances.

Sunshine Law Compliance

1. We obtained and inspected the Township's Public Records Policy to determine the policy was in accordance with Ohio Rev. Code §§ 149.43(E)(2) and 149.43(B)(7)(c) and did not limit the number of responses that may be made to a particular person, limit the number of responses during a specified period of time, or establish a fixed period of time before it will respond unless that period is less than eight hours. We found no exceptions.
2. We selected five public records requests from the engagement period and inspected each request to determine the following:
 - a. The Township was compliant and responded to the request in accordance with their adopted policy as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 149.43(B)(1). For five of the five public records requests selected, the Township did not respond to the request in accordance with their adopted policy. See the table below.

Date Request Received	Date Request Fulfilled	Policy Response Time (in Business days)	Actual Response Time (in Business days)
9/29/22	11/7/22	Reasonable amount of time, "if possible" 3 days	39
4/11/22	8/1/22	Reasonable amount of time, "if possible" 3 days	112
2/14/22	5/11/22	Reasonable amount of time, "if possible" 3 days	30
12/10/21	8/1/22	Reasonable amount of time, "if possible" 3 days	234
1/25/22	3/2/22	Reasonable amount of time, "if possible" 3 days	37

- b. The Township did not have any denied public records requests during the engagement period.
 - c. The Township was redacting records and making the redactions visible and provided an explanation which included the legal authority to the requester as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 149.43(B)(1). We found no exceptions.
3. We inquired whether the Township had a records retention schedule and observed that it was readily available to the public as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 149.43(B)(2). We found no exceptions.
 4. We inspected written evidence that the Public Records Policy was provided to the records custodian/manager as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 149.43(E)(2). We found no exceptions.
 5. We inspected the Township's policy manual and determined the public records policy was included as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 149.43(E)(2). We found no exceptions.
 6. We observed that the Township's poster describing their Public Records Policy was displayed conspicuously in all branches of the Township as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 149.43(E)(2). We found no exceptions.
 7. We inquired with Township management and determined that the Township did not have any applications for record disposal submitted to the Records Commission during the engagement period.
 8. We inspected individual proof of attendance and determined whether each elected official in accordance with Ohio Rev. Code § 149.43(E)(1) (or his/her designee) successfully attended a certified three-hour Public Records Training for each term of office as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 109.43(B). We found no exceptions.
 9. We inspected the public notices for the public meetings held during the engagement period and determined the Township notified the general public and news media of when and where meetings during the engagement period were to be held as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 121.22(F). We found no exceptions.
 10. We inspected the minutes of public meetings during the engagement period in accordance with Ohio Rev. Code § 121.22(C) and determined whether they were:
 - a. Prepared – a file is created following the date of the meeting
 - b. Filed – placed with similar documents in an organized manner
 - c. Maintained - retained, at a minimum, for the engagement period
 - d. Open to public inspection – available for public viewing or request.
 We found no exceptions.

11. We inspected the minutes from the engagement period in accordance with Ohio Rev. Code § 121.22(G) and determined the following:
 - a. Executive sessions were only held at regular or special meetings.
 - b. The purpose for the meetings and going into an executive session (when applicable) correlated with one of the matters listed in Ohio Rev. Code § 121.22(G).
 - c. Formal governing board actions were adopted in open meetings.We found no exceptions.

HB 481 / HB 614 Coronavirus Relief Fund (CRF) Compliance

1. We inquired of management and those charged with governance and documented how the Township decided to spend their CRF allocations and how the Township documented their compliance with the CARES Act three-prong test. We then selected five transactions including payroll, non-payroll, and subgrant/subloan transactions. and determined the Township:
 - a. Spent the CRF money (including additional distributions or redistributions) in accordance with use of funds requirements and
 - b. Maintained appropriate supporting documentation.We found no exceptions.

Contract Compliance:

1. We inspected the Minutes and identified the Township had expenditures subject to competitive bidding. We found no exceptions.
2. We selected one contract over \$50,000 for 2022 and one for 2021 and
 - a. We inspected the contract and other bids for the contracted expenditure and determined:
 - i. The Township accepted the lowest bid and met the requirements of Ohio Rev. Code.
 - ii. No bid splitting occurred
 - iii. No deliberate attempts to evade bid limitations occurred, such as successive contracts just under the bid amount, occurred.
 - iv. No apparent interest in the contract by a public official occurred.We found no exceptions.

Other Compliance

1. Ohio Rev. Code § 117.38 requires townships to file their financial information in the HINKLE system within 60 days after the close of the fiscal year. This statute also permits the Auditor of State to extend the deadline for filing a financial report and establish terms and conditions for any such extension. Auditor of State established policies regarding the filing of complete financial statements, as defined in AOS Bulletin 2015-007 in the Hinkle System. We confirmed the Township filed their complete financial statements, as defined by AOS Bulletin 2015-007 and Auditor of State established policy, within the allotted timeframe for the years ended December 31, 2022 and 2021 in the Hinkle system. We found no exceptions.
2. We inspected the Fiscal Integrity Act Portal (<http://www.ohioauditor.gov/fiscalintegrity/default.html>) to determine whether the fiscal officer obtained the training required by Ohio Rev. Code §§ 507.12 and 733.81. Fiscal Officer obtained the required training.

We were engaged by the Township to perform this agreed-upon procedures engagement and conducted our engagement in accordance with the attestation standards established by the AICPA and the Comptroller General of the United States' *Government Auditing Standards*. We were not engaged to, and did not conduct an examination or review engagement, the objective of which would be the expression of an opinion or conclusion, respectively, on the Township's receipts, disbursements, balances and compliance with certain laws and regulations. Accordingly, we do not express an opinion or conclusion. Had we performed additional procedures, other matters might have come to our attention that would have been reported to you.

We are required to be independent of the Township and to meet our ethical responsibilities, in accordance with the ethical requirements established by the Comptroller General of the United States' *Government Auditing Standards* related to our agreed upon procedures engagement.



Keith Faber
Auditor of State
Columbus, Ohio

September 20, 2023

This page intentionally left blank.

OHIO AUDITOR OF STATE KEITH FABER



HUBBARD TOWNSHIP

TRUMBULL COUNTY

AUDITOR OF STATE OF OHIO CERTIFICATION

This is a true and correct copy of the report, which is required to be filed pursuant to Section 117.26, Revised Code, and which is filed in the Office of the Ohio Auditor of State in Columbus, Ohio.



Certified for Release 10/5/2023

88 East Broad Street, Columbus, Ohio 43215
Phone: 614-466-4514 or 800-282-0370

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at
www.ohioauditor.gov