



THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK

OHIO AUDITOR OF STATE KEITH FABER



88 East Broad Street, 5th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3506
(614) 466-3402 or (800) 443-9275
CentralRegion@ohioauditor.gov

INDEPENDENT ACCOUNTANTS' REPORT ON APPLYING AGREED-UPON PROCEDURES

Village of Marble Cliff
Franklin County
1600 Fernwood Avenue
Columbus, Ohio 43212

We have performed the procedures enumerated below, which were agreed to by the Village Council, Mayor and the management of the Village of Marble Cliff (the Village), on the receipts, disbursements and balances recorded in the Villages cash basis accounting records for the years ended December 31, 2019 and 2018 and certain compliance requirements related to those transactions and balances, included in the information provided to us by the management of the Village. The Village is responsible for the receipts, disbursements and balances recorded in the cash basis accounting records for the years ended December 31, 2019 and 2018 and certain compliance requirements related to these transactions and balances included in the information provided to us by the Village. The sufficiency of the procedures is solely the responsibility of the parties specified in this report. Consequently, we make no representation regarding the sufficiency of the procedures described below either for the purpose for which this report has been requested or for any other purpose.

This report only describes exceptions exceeding \$10.

Cash and Investments

1. We recalculated the December 31, 2019 and December 31, 2018 bank reconciliations. We found no exceptions.
2. We agreed the January 1, 2018 beginning fund balances recorded in the Fund Ledger Report to the December 31, 2017 balances in the prior year audited statements. We found no exceptions. We also agreed the January 1, 2019 beginning fund balances recorded in the Fund Ledger Report to the December 31, 2018 balances in the Fund Ledger Report. We found no exceptions.
3. We agreed the totals per the bank reconciliations to the total of the December 31, 2019 and 2018 fund cash balances reported in the Fund Status Report and the financial statements filed by the Village in the Hinkle System. The amounts agreed.
4. We confirmed the December 31, 2019 bank and investment account balances with the Village's financial institutions. We observed the year-end bank balance for the Mayors Court bank account on financial institution's website. We found no exceptions. The balance agreed. We also agreed the confirmed balances to the amounts appearing in the December 31, 2019 bank reconciliation without exception.
5. We selected all reconciling debits (such as outstanding checks) from the December 31, 2019 bank reconciliation:
 - a. We traced each debit to the subsequent January and February bank statements, or the debit was still properly outstanding. We found no exceptions.
 - b. We traced the amounts and dates to the check register, to determine the debits were dated prior to December 31. There were no exceptions.

Efficient • Effective • Transparent

6. We inspected investments held at December 31, 2019 and December 31, 2018 to determine that they:
 - a. Were of a type authorized by Ohio Rev. Code Sections 135.13, 135.14 or 135.144. We found no exceptions.
 - b. Mature within the prescribed time limits noted in Ohio Rev. Code Section 135.13 or 135.14. We noted no exceptions.

Income Tax Receipts

1. We obtained the 2019 and 2018 monthly Income Tax Remittance reports submitted by the City of Columbus, the agency responsible for collecting income taxes on behalf of the Village. We compared the total gross income taxes per year to the Village's Receipt Detail Report. The amounts agreed.

Debt

1. From the prior audit documentation, we observed the following bonds and loans were outstanding as of December 31, 2017. These amounts agreed to the Villages January 1, 2018 balances on the summary we used in procedure 3.

Issue	Principal outstanding as of December 31, 2017:
General Obligation Bonds	\$300,000
OPWC Loan #1 – Storm Water & Sewer	\$42,565
OPWC Loan #2 – Waterline Improvements	\$138,373
Franklin County Infrastructure Loan	\$111,969

2. We inquired of management, and inspected the Receipt Register Report and Payment Register Detail Report for evidence of debt issued during 2019 or 2018 or debt payment activity during 2019 or 2018. All debt agreed to the summary we used in procedure 3.
3. We obtained a summary of bond and loan debt activity for 2019 and 2018 and agreed principal and interest payments from the related debt amortization schedules to debt service fund payments reported in the Payment Register Detail Report. We also compared the date the debt service payments were due to the date the Village made the payments. We found no exceptions.

Payroll Cash Disbursements

1. We selected one payroll check for five employees from 2019 and one payroll check for five employees from 2018 from the Payment Register Detail and:
 - a. We compared the hours and pay rate, or salary recorded in the Payment Register Detail to supporting documentation (the ordinance passed September 16, 2002). We found no exceptions.
 - b. We recomputed gross and net pay and agreed it to the amount recorded in the payroll register. We found no exceptions.
 - c. We inspected the fund and account codes to which the check was posted to determine the posting was reasonable based on the employees' duties as documented in the as required by statute. We also confirmed the payment was posted to the proper year. We found no exceptions.

2. We inspected the last remittance of tax and retirement withholdings for the year ended December 31, 2019 to confirm remittances were timely paid, and if the amounts paid agreed to the amounts withheld, plus the employer's share where applicable, during the final withholding period during 2019. We observed the following:

Withholding (plus employer share, where applicable)	Date Due	Date Paid	Amount Due	Amount Paid
Federal income taxes & Medicare (and social security, for employees not enrolled in pension system)	January 31, 2020	December 19, 2019	\$2,296.20	\$2,296.20
State income taxes	January 31, 2020	December 19, 2019	\$373.68	\$373.68
Village of Marble Cliff income tax	January 31, 2020	December 19, 2019	\$465.45	\$465.45
OPERS retirement	January 30, 2020	December 12, 2019	\$1,861.80	\$1,861.80

Non-Payroll Cash Disbursements

1. We selected 10 disbursements from the Payment Register Detail Report for the year ended December 31, 2019 and 10 from the year ended 2018 and determined whether:
 - a. The disbursements were for a proper public purpose. We found no exceptions.
 - b. The check number, date, payee name and amount recorded on the returned, canceled check agreed to the check number, date, payee name and amount recorded in the Payment Register Detail Report and to the names and amounts on the supporting invoices. We found no exceptions.
 - c. The payment was posted to a fund consistent with the restricted purpose for which the fund's cash can be used. We found no exceptions.
 - d. The fiscal officer certified disbursements requiring certification or issued a *Then and Now Certificate*, as required by Ohio Rev. Code Section 5705.41(D). We found no exceptions.

Compliance – Budgetary

1. Ohio Rev. Code Section 5705.41(B) prohibits expenditures (disbursements plus certified commitments) from exceeding appropriations. We compared total expenditures to total approved appropriations (Ohio Rev. Code Section 5705.38 and 5705.40) plus any carryover appropriations for the years ended December 31, 2019 and 2018 for the General, Street Maintenance and Bond Retirement funds, as recorded in the Appropriation Status Report. We observed no funds for which expenditures exceeded appropriations.
2. We inspected the Appropriation Ledger Report for the Paul J Falco Scholarship Fund. In 2018, the Village did not disburse more than the interest earned on the corpus of the Paul J. Falco Scholarship Fund. In June of 2019, the Village delegated management and investment of the fund and its balance in full to the Columbus Foundation. We inspected the consultation letter from the Village's attorney for the proper release of these funds. No exceptions were noted.

3. We inspected the 2019 and 2018 Interfund Transfer Listing and Appropriation Status Reports for evidence of interfund transfers exceeding \$10,000 which Ohio Rev. Code Sections 5705.14 - .16 restrict. We found no evidence of transfers these Sections prohibit, or for which Section 5705.16 would require approval by the Tax Commissioner.
4. We inspected the Cash Summary by Fund Report for the years ended December 31, 2019 and 2018 for negative cash fund balance. Ohio Rev. Code Section 5705.10(I) provides that money paid into a fund must be used for the purposes for which such fund is established. As a result, a negative fund cash balance indicates that money from one fund was used to cover the expenses of another. There were no funds having negative cash fund balances.

Sunshine Law Compliance

1. We obtained and inspected the Village's Public Records Policy to determine the policy was in accordance with Ohio Rev. Code § 149.43(E)(2) and did not limit the number of responses that may be made to a particular person, limit the number of responses during a specified period of time, or establish a fixed period of time before it will respond unless that period is less than eight hours. We found no exceptions.
2. We selected all public records requests from the engagement period and inspected each request to determine the Village was compliant and responded to the request in accordance with their adopted policy as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 149.43(E)(2). One request was responded to after 4 days which is longer than the 3 days required per the policy adopted by the Village.
3. We inquired with Village management and determined that the Village did not have any denied public records requests during the engagement period.
4. We selected all public records requests with redactions from the engagement period and inspected to determine the Village was redacting records and making the redactions visible, and provided an explanation which included the legal authority to the requester as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 149.43(B)(1). We found no exceptions.
5. We inquired whether the Village had a records retention schedule, and observed that it was readily available to the public as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 149.43(B)(2). We found no exceptions.
6. We inspected written evidence that the Public Records Policy was provided to the records custodian/manager as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 149.43(E)(2). We found no exceptions.
7. We inspected the Village's policy manual and determined the public records policy was included as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 149.43(E)(2). We found no exceptions.
8. We observed that the Village's poster describing their Public Records Policy was displayed conspicuously in all branches of the Village as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 149.43(E)(2). We found no exceptions.
9. We inquired with Village management and determined that the Village did not have any applications for record disposal submitted to the Records Commission during the engagement period.

10. We inspected individual training certificates and determined whether each elected official in accordance with Ohio Rev. Code § 149.43(E)(1) (or his/her designee) successfully attended a certified three-hour Public Records Training for each term of office as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 109.43(B). We found no exceptions.
11. We inspected the public notices for the public meetings held during the engagement period and determined the Village notified the general public and news media of when and where meetings during the engagement period were to be held as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 121.22(F). We found no exceptions.
12. We inspected the minutes of public meetings during the engagement period in accordance with Ohio Rev. Code § 121.22(C) and determined whether they were:
 - a. Prepared – a file is created following the date of the meeting
 - b. Filed – placed with similar documents in an organized manner
 - c. Maintained - retained, at a minimum, for the engagement period
 - d. Open to public inspection – available for public viewing or request.We found no exceptions.
13. We inspected the minutes from the engagement period in accordance with Ohio Rev. Code § 121.22(G) and determined the following:
 - a. Executive sessions were only held at regular or special meetings.
 - b. The purpose for the meetings and going into an executive session (when applicable) correlated with one of the matters listed in Ohio Rev. Code Section 121.22(G).
 - c. Formal governing board actions were adopted in open meetings.We found no exceptions.

Other Compliance

1. Ohio Rev. Code Section 117.38 requires villages to file their financial information in the HINKLE system within 60 days after the close of the fiscal year. This statute also permits the Auditor of State to extend the deadline for filing a financial report and establish terms and conditions for any such extension. Auditor of State established policies, regarding the filing of complete financial statements, as defined in AOS Bulletin 2015-007 in the Hinkle System. We confirmed the Village filed their complete financial statements, as defined by AOS Bulletin 2015-007 and Auditor of State established policy within the allotted timeframe for the years ended December 31, 2019 and 2018 in the Hinkle system. There were no exceptions.
2. For all credit card accounts we obtained:
 - copies of existing internal control policies,
 - a list of authorized users, and
 - a list of all credit card account transactions.
 - a. We inspected the established policy obtained above and determined it is:
 - i. in compliance with the HB 312 statutory requirements, and
 - ii. implemented by the entity.We found no exceptions.
 - b. We selected 1 credit card transaction from each account for testing. For selected transactions we inspected documentation to determine that:
 - i. Use was by an authorized user within the guidelines established in the policy, and
 - ii. Each transaction was supported with original invoices and for a proper public purpose.We found no exceptions.

- c. We selected 3 credit card statements from each credit card account for testing. For selected statements we inspected documentation to determine that:
 - i. No unpaid beginning balance was carried forward to the current billing cycle,
 - ii. Ending statement balance was paid in full, and
 - iii. Statement contained no interest or late fees.We found no exceptions.

This agreed-upon procedures engagement was conducted in accordance with the American Institute of Certified Public Accountants attestation standards and applicable attestation engagement standards included in the Comptroller General of the United States' *Government Auditing Standards*. We were not engaged to, and did not conduct an examination or review, the objective of which would be the expression of an opinion or conclusion, respectively, on the Village's receipts, disbursements, balances and compliance with certain laws and regulations. Accordingly, we do not express an opinion or conclusion. Had we performed additional procedures, other matters might have come to our attention that would have been reported to you.

This report is to provide assistance in the evaluation of the Village's receipts, disbursements and balances recorded in their cash-basis accounting records for the years ended December 31, 2019 and 2018, and certain compliance requirements related to these transactions and balances and is not suitable for any other purpose.



Keith Faber
Auditor of State
Columbus, Ohio

January 26, 2021

OHIO AUDITOR OF STATE KEITH FABER



VILLAGE OF MARBLE CLIFF

FRANKLIN COUNTY

AUDITOR OF STATE OF OHIO CERTIFICATION

This is a true and correct copy of the report, which is required to be filed pursuant to Section 117.26, Revised Code, and which is filed in the Office of the Ohio Auditor of State in Columbus, Ohio.



Certified for Release 2/16/2021

88 East Broad Street, Columbus, Ohio 43215
Phone: 614-466-4514 or 800-282-0370

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at
www.ohioauditor.gov