



Dave Yost • Auditor of State

The State of Ohio, Auditor of State

# Second Interim Report on Student Attendance and Accountability System





# Dave Yost • Auditor of State

To the People of the State of Ohio:

In response to reports of irregular student attendance, enrollment and withdrawal practices within multiple school districts and a statewide concern over the integrity of the Ohio Department of Education (ODE) accountability and reporting system, the Auditor of State's (AOS) Office is issuing its second interim report for an audit conducted in accordance with Ohio Revised Code Section 117.11. This audit includes an objective review and assessment of ODE accountability policies, procedures and data, and local school district attendance, enrollment, withdrawal and reporting practices.

This interim report includes the introduction, methodology, and summary of results to date for school districts with levies on the November 2012 ballot.

This engagement is not a financial or performance audit, the objectives of which would be vastly different. Therefore, it is not within the scope of this work to conduct a comprehensive and detailed examination of local school report cards or Ohio's Accountability system. Additionally, certain information included in this report was derived from ODE, Information Technology Center (ITC), and school district Student Information System (SIS), which remains subject to change.

This report has been provided to the ODE and discussed with the schools selected for testing whose results are included within. ODE is encouraged to use the results of this review as a resource in improving its Accountability guidance and compliance monitoring.

Additional copies of this report can be requested by calling the Clerk of the Bureau's office at (614) 466-2310 or toll free at (800) 282-0370. In addition, this report can be accessed online through the Auditor of State of Ohio website at <http://www.ohioauditor.gov> by choosing the "Audit Search" option.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Dave Yost". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large, looping "D" and "Y".

Dave Yost  
Auditor of State

October 23, 2012

88 East Broad Street, Fifth Floor, Columbus, Ohio 43215-3506

Phone: 614-466-4514 or 800-282-0370 Fax: 614-466-4490

[www.ohioauditor.gov](http://www.ohioauditor.gov)

**This page intentionally left blank.**

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

1. INTRODUCTION ..... 4

2. METHODOLOGY ..... 4

3. SECOND-PHASE SCHOOL DISTRICTS WITH LEVIES..... 6

3.1. SECOND-PHASE LEVY SCHOOLS SELECTED FOR TESTING ..... 12

4. SECOND-PHASE LEVY SCHOOLS SUMMARY OF TESTING RESULTS ..... 15

4.1. SECOND-PHASE LEVY SCHOOL WITH EVIDENCE OF SCRUBBING..... 15

4.2. SECOND-PHASE LEVY SCHOOLS WITH ERRORS..... 15

4.3. SECOND-PHASE LEVY SCHOOLS FOUND TO BE CLEAN ..... 20

4.4. INDETERMINATE SECOND-PHASE LEVY SCHOOLS ..... 23

5. SCHOOL DISTRICT EXCLUSION LIST ..... 23

6. CONCLUSION ..... 25

7. VIEWS OF RESPONSIBLE SCHOOL OFFICIALS ..... 25

## 1. INTRODUCTION

---

AOS is conducting this audit in accordance with Ohio Revised Code Section 117.11. This engagement is not a financial or performance audit, the objectives of which would be vastly different. Therefore, it is not within the scope of this work to conduct a comprehensive and detailed examination of local school report cards or Ohio's Accountability system. Additionally, certain information included in this report was derived from ODE, ITC, and school district SIS, which may not be completely accurate.

This is the Auditor of State's (AOS) second interim report related to the AOS statewide review of student attendance, enrollment and withdrawal practices among Ohio school districts. As more fully described in the first AOS *Interim Report on Student Attendance Data and Accountability System* dated October 4, 2012, the purpose of the statewide review is threefold: (1) to identify systemic, and potentially duplicitous, student attendance and enrollment practices among Ohio schools; (2) to provide recommendations to the Ohio Department of Education (ODE) and Ohio General Assembly for making future policy and legislative improvements to Ohio's Accountability system; and (3) to determine whether schools are scrubbing enrollment data to improve their local report card scores. For the purposes of this report, scrubbing is the practice of removing students from enrollment without lawful reason, regardless of the purported motivation. The term "scrubbing" does not necessarily imply malintent.

For the first phase of the student attendance review, AOS selected 100 schools with the highest number of students that took the assessment tests and whose test scores were pushed to the state based on a break in enrollment or change in the Where Kids Count (WKC) during the 2010-11 school year. However, since schools likely adopted their attendance practices over time, many without propensity to introduce "breaks" for the purpose of improving attendance, AOS selected an additional 28 schools with fewer student withdrawals for testing and comparison purposes.

The majority of the schools AOS selected for the first-phase review are among two categories of typology: "Urban – low median income, high poverty" and "Major Urban – very high poverty". Additionally, all of the schools with evidence of scrubbing identified in the first AOS interim report fell within one of these two district types. The goal of the initial selection was to identify and study the indices needed to predict scrubbing with a reasonable degree of confidence. Accordingly, AOS attempted to examine 100% of the student files identified for each school to provide a meaningful data set from which to identify such indices with predictive value.

The results and status of the first-phase of the student attendance review were reported in the October 4, 2012 Interim Report. AOS will report the final status of these first-phase schools in its Final Report on Student Attendance Data and Accountability System.

For the second phase of the student attendance review included in this report, AOS selected an additional 81 schools with levies on the November 2012 ballot to aid the public in making informed decisions about their upcoming school levies.

## 2. METHODOLOGY

---

The goal of the student attendance reviews is to ensure compliance with Ohio's Accountability system. Obviously, no matter how competent the auditor or how sophisticated the school's student information system and enrollment processes, reviewing each student's enrollment documentation for all schools is a physical impossibility. Even if 100 percent of Ohio's tested students pushed to the State report card could be tested, the cost of testing would likely exceed the expected benefits (the assurance that accompanies examining 100 percent of the total) to be derived. The cost per student file examined is approximately

§30. Because of this cost-benefit challenge, AOS used widely utilized sampling techniques, discussed below, and has contracted with the Ohio State University for expert statistical consulting services in an attempt to develop meaningful statistical predictors for the balance of our work.

AOS ranked schools with the greatest gains in attendance and State report card roll-ups over time as compared to other schools of similar size and demographics. AOS used this ranking to select a sample of schools with levies on the upcoming November ballot for the second phase of student attendance testing. AOS excluded schools previously tested in the first phase of the attendance review from the second-phase levy schools sample. As a result, AOS tested 81 schools<sup>1</sup> from 47 school districts out of a statewide total of 184 school districts with levies on the November ballot. The purpose of the phase-two student attendance testing was twofold: (1) to identify whether schools with proposed tax levies on the November 6, 2012 ballot may be scrubbing, and (2) to expand the existing data set for use in developing indices with predictive value. AOS will use the results gleaned from the first two phases to further develop statistical indices for identifying schools with scrubbing indicators for testing in phase three.

Auditors frequently use audit sampling procedures to obtain audit evidence. The American Institute of Certified Public Accountants (AICPA) auditing standards define audit sampling as the application of an audit procedure to less than 100 percent of the items within an account balance or class of transactions for the purpose of evaluating some characteristic of the balance or class. In other words, audit sampling may provide auditors an appropriate basis on which to conclude on a characteristic of a population based on examining evidence regarding that characteristic from a subset of the population. When using audit sampling, the auditor may choose between a statistical and a non-statistical approach. Both methods are acceptable under these standards. Also, AOS does not rely solely on the results of any single type of procedure to obtain sufficient appropriate audit evidence. Rather, audit conclusions were based on evidence obtained from several sources and by applying a variety of audit procedures.

Unlike the first-phase schools and districts where AOS tested 100 percent of tested students pushed to the State report card, AOS selected a sample of students from individual schools to test in phase two of the attendance review. AOS believes a sampling approach is appropriate to communicate the results of the statewide student attendance review expeditiously while simultaneously ensuring the costs do not outweigh the relative benefits for the work performed. The AICPA's auditing standards impose no requirement to use quantitative aids, such as sample size tables, to determine sample size, nor do they impose a rule regarding minimum sample size. The auditor's professional judgment is the key to determining appropriate sample sizes. For purposes of testing the phase-two schools with levies, AOS chose to sample 30 tested students for most schools. AOS selected this sample size based, in part, on the AICPA's attribute sampling tables, the relatively small population of students pushed to the state report card at most schools, the expected rate of deviation, and the anticipated cost-benefit of testing more than 30 students at an individual school.<sup>2</sup>

Finally, AOS analyzed the number of tested students pushed to the State report card for all schools (both levy and non-levy schools) and calculated two standard deviations from the mean to determine the variation each school had from the average number of students pushed to the State report card for all schools during the 2010-11 school year. Two standard deviations from the mean accounts for roughly

---

<sup>1</sup> The sample levy schools had a non-causal correlation to the number of students rolled up to the State report card despite gains in attendance.

<sup>2</sup> However, AOS tested 100 percent of the tested students pushed to the state report card for certain phase-two schools that were tested prior to the finalization of the AOS sampling methodology. AOS also tested 100 percent of the tested students pushed to the state report card where schools had less than 30 or slightly more than 30 tested students.

95% of the schools in Ohio. The standard deviation tells a user how diverse the number of tested students pushed to the State report card are for each school. In this way, AOS used the standard deviation to identify schools with unusual or unexplained differences in the number of tested students pushed to the State report card. Similarly, AOS used the standard deviation to determine a benchmark for excluding certain school districts from AOS student attendance testing. AOS identified certain school districts for which all schools within the district were reasonably close to the mean number of tested students pushed to the State report card for all schools. Based on this analysis, AOS determined those districts with all school buildings in the bottom 25% of the “tested students pushed to the state percentage” category. There were 26 school districts (refer to section 5 of this report for a list of these school districts) that met these criteria and will be excluded from the scope of AOS student attendance testing due to the remote likelihood of significant errors in the number of tested students pushed to the state report card.

### 3. SECOND-PHASE SCHOOL DISTRICTS WITH LEVIES

---

AOS identified 184 school districts with levies proposed for the November 6, 2012 ballot, of which AOS was able to review 81 schools. The remainder of the schools could not be completed within the available timeframe, and will be part of the final phase of the audit.

Below is a list of the 184 school districts with levies.

| <b>SECOND PHASE SCHOOL DISTRICTS WITH LEVIES<sup>3</sup></b> |  |               |                     |           |
|--|--|---------------|---------------------|-----------|
| <i>(Refer to footnote 3 definition on page 6)</i>            |  |               |                     |           |
|  | <b>School District Name</b>                        | <b>County</b> | <b>District IRN</b> |           |
| 1.   | Akron City School District                         | Summit        | 43489               | <b>ii</b> |
| 2.   | Amherst EVSD                                       | Lorain        | 45195               |           |
| 3.   | Anthony Wayne Local School District                | Lucas         | 48207               |           |
| 4.   | Apollo Career Center                               | Allen         | 50773               | <b>i</b>  |
| 5.   | Ashland City School District                       | Ashland       | 43505               |           |
| 6.   | Ashland County-West Holmes Joint Vocational School | Ashland       | 62042               | <b>i</b>  |
| 7.   | Ashtabula Area City Schools                        | Ashtabula     | 43513               |           |
| 8.   | Athens City School District                        | Athens        | 43521               |           |

<sup>3</sup> The Joint Vocational Schools (JVS) and Career Technical Planning Districts (CTPD) are denoted with an “i” in the table below. The state does not compute a report card for JVS and CTPD’s; therefore, AOS excluded these schools from student attendance testing.

Also, other testing results or status for certain first-phase schools from the levy school districts in the table denoted with an “ii” were previously included in our AOS Interim Report on Student Attendance Data and Accountability System dated October 4, 2012.



## SECOND PHASE SCHOOL DISTRICTS WITH LEVIES<sup>3</sup>

*(Refer to footnote 3 definition on page 6)*

|     | School District Name                                 | County     | District IRN |    |
|-----|--|------------|--------------|----|
| 9.  | Aurora City School District                          | Portage    | 49171        |    |
| 10. | Avon Lake City School District                       | Lorain     | 48124        | ii |
| 11. | Avon Local School District                           | Lorain     | 48116        |    |
| 12. | Barberton City School District                       | Summit     | 43539        |    |
| 13. | Batavia Local School District                        | Clermont   | 46300        |    |
| 14. | Bay Village City School District                     | Cuyahoga   | 43547        |    |
| 15. | Beavercreek City School District                     | Greene     | 47241        |    |
| 16. | Bellaire Local School District                       | Belmont    | 43570        |    |
| 17. | Bellevue City School District                        | Huron      | 43596        |    |
| 18. | Bettsville Local School District                     | Seneca     | 49692        |    |
| 19. | Black River Local School District                    | Medina     | 48462        |    |
| 20. | Blanchester Local School District                    | Clinton    | 46383        |    |
| 21. | Boardman Local School District                       | Mahoning   | 48306        |    |
| 22. | Bowling Green Schools                                | Wood       | 43638        |    |
| 23. | Brookfield Local School District                     | Trumbull   | 50120        |    |
| 24. | Brooklyn City School District                        | Cuyahoga   | 43653        |    |
| 25. | Brown Local School District                          | Carroll    | 46177        |    |
| 26. | Buckeye Joint Vocational School District             | Tuscarawas | 51656        | i  |
| 27. | Buckeye Local School District                        | Jefferson  | 47787        |    |
| 28. | Cambridge City School District                       | Guernsey   | 43695        |    |
| 29. | Canton Local School District                         | Stark      | 49833        |    |
| 30. | Cardinal Local School District                       | Geauga     | 47175        |    |
| 31. | Cardington-Lincoln Local School District             | Morrow     | 48793        | ii |
| 32. | Carlisle Local School District                       | Warren     | 50419        |    |
| 33. | Cedar-Cliff Local School District                    | Greene     | 47258        |    |
| 34. | Celina City School District                          | Mercer     | 43729        |    |
| 35. | Centerburg Local School District                     | Knox       | 47829        |    |
| 36. | Centerville City School District                     | Montgomery | 43737        |    |
| 37. | Champion Local School District                       | Trumbull   | 50138        |    |
| 38. | Chardon Local School District                        | Geauga     | 47183        |    |
| 39. | Cincinnati City School District                      | Hamilton   | 43752        | ii |
| 40. | Clark-Shawnee Local School District                  | Clark      | 46284        |    |
| 41. | Clearview Local School District                      | Lorain     | 48132        |    |
| 42. | Cleveland Municipal School District                  | Cuyahoga   | 43786        | ii |
| 43. | Cloverleaf Local School District                     | Medina     | 48488        |    |
| 44. | Clyde-Green Springs Exempted Village School District | Sandusky   | 45302        |    |
| 45. | Columbia Local School District                       | Lorain     | 48140        |    |

## SECOND PHASE SCHOOL DISTRICTS WITH LEVIES<sup>3</sup>

*(Refer to footnote 3 definition on page 6)*

|     | School District Name                              | County     | District IRN |           |
|-----|---|------------|--------------|-----------|
| 46. | Conotton Valley Union Local School District       | Harrison   | 47548        |           |
| 47. | Coshocton City School District                    | Coshocton  | 43828        |           |
| 48. | Coventry Local School District                    | Summit     | 49999        |           |
| 49. | Crestwood Local School District                   | Portage    | 49189        |           |
| 50. | Dover City School District                        | Tuscarawas | 43893        |           |
| 51. | Dublin City School District                       | Franklin   | 47027        |           |
| 52. | East Clinton Local School District                | Clinton    | 46409        |           |
| 53. | East Knox School District                         | Knox       | 47845        |           |
| 54. | Edison Local School District                      | Erie       | 46789        |           |
| 55. | Edison Local School District                      | Jefferson  | 47795        |           |
| 56. | Elida Local School District                       | Allen      | 45773        |           |
| 57. | Elyria City School District                       | Lorain     | 43943        |           |
| 58. | Euclid City School District                       | Cuyahoga   | 43950        | <b>ii</b> |
| 59. | Fairborn City School District                     | Greene     | 43968        |           |
| 60. | Fairlawn Local School                             | Shelby     | 49775        |           |
| 61. | Fairview Park City School District Proposed       | Cuyahoga   | 43976        |           |
| 62. | Field Local School District                       | Portage    | 49197        |           |
| 63. | Finneytown Local School District                  | Hamilton   | 47332        |           |
| 64. | Fremont Schools                                   | Sandusky   | 44016        |           |
| 65. | Galion City School District                       | Crawford   | 44024        |           |
| 66. | Grand Valley Local School District                | Ashtabula  | 45864        |           |
| 67. | Green School District                             | Scioto     | 49619        |           |
| 68. | Greenon Local School District                     | Clark      | 46235        |           |
| 69. | Hillsdale Local School District                   | Ashland    | 45823        |           |
| 70. | Howland Local School District                     | Trumbull   | 50161        |           |
| 71. | Huber Heights City School District                | Montgomery | 48751        |           |
| 72. | Hudson City School District                       | Summit     | 50021        |           |
| 73. | Indian Creek Local School District                | Jefferson  | 47803        |           |
| 74. | Indian Lake Local School District                 | Logan      | 48082        |           |
| 75. | Jackson Milton Local School District              | Mahoning   | 48322        |           |
| 76. | Jefferson Area Local School District              | Ashtabula  | 45872        |           |
| 77. | Jefferson County Joint Vocational School District | Jefferson  | 51128        | <b>i</b>  |
| 78. | Jefferson Township Local School District          | Montgomery | 48686        | <b>ii</b> |
| 79. | Johnstown-Monroe Local School District            | Licking    | 47985        |           |
| 80. | Joseph Badger Local School District               | Trumbull   | 50179        |           |
| 81. | Kirtland Local School                             | Lake       | 47878        |           |
| 82. | Ledgemont Local School District                   | Geauga     | 47209        |           |

## SECOND PHASE SCHOOL DISTRICTS WITH LEVIES<sup>3</sup>

*(Refer to footnote 3 definition on page 6)*

|      | School District Name                     | County     | District IRN |    |
|------|--|------------|--------------|----|
| 83.  | Licking Heights Local School             | Licking    | 48009        |    |
| 84.  | Lima City School District                | Allen      | 44222        | ii |
| 85.  | Lorain City School District              | Lorain     | 44263        | ii |
| 86.  | Lorain County Joint Vocational School    | Lorain     | 51227        | i  |
| 87.  | Louisville City School District          | Stark      | 49874        |    |
| 88.  | Madison-Plains Local School District     | Madison    | 48272        |    |
| 89.  | Mansfield City School District           | Richland   | 44297        | ii |
| 90.  | Maple Heights City School District       | Cuyahoga   | 44305        |    |
| 91.  | Marlington Local School District         | Stark      | 49882        |    |
| 92.  | Marysville School District               | Union      | 45476        |    |
| 93.  | Massillon City School District           | Stark      | 44354        |    |
| 94.  | Mathews Local School District            | Trumbull   | 50153        |    |
| 95.  | Medina City School District              | Medina     | 44388        |    |
| 96.  | Miami East Local School District         | Miami      | 48629        |    |
| 97.  | Miamisburg City School District          | Montgomery | 44396        |    |
| 98.  | Midview Local School District            | Lorain     | 48173        |    |
| 99.  | Milford Exempted Village School District | Clermont   | 45500        |    |
| 100. | Milton-Union EVSD                        | Miami      | 44518        |    |
| 101. | Minerva Local School District            | Stark      | 49890        |    |
| 102. | Mohawk Local School District             | Wyandot    | 50740        | ii |
| 103. | Monroe Local Schools                     | Butler     | 139303       |    |
| 104. | Monroeville Local School District        | Huron      | 47712        |    |
| 105. | Mount Vernon City School District        | Knox       | 44420        |    |
| 106. | Mt. Healthy City School District         | Hamilton   | 44412        | ii |
| 107. | Napoleon Area City Schools               | Henry      | 44438        |    |
| 108. | New Albany-Plain Local School District   | Franklin   | 46995        |    |
| 109. | New Lebanon Local School District        | Montgomery | 48710        |    |
| 110. | New Lexington City School District       | Perry      | 44479        | ii |
| 111. | New Philadelphia City School District    | Tuscarawas | 44487        |    |
| 112. | Newbury Local School District            | Geauga     | 47217        |    |
| 113. | Newton Local School District             | Miami      | 48637        |    |
| 114. | Nordonia Hills City School District      | Summit     | 50047        |    |
| 115. | North Fork Local School District         | Licking    | 48025        |    |
| 116. | North Ridgeville City School District    | Lorain     | 44537        |    |
| 117. | North Royalton City School District      | Cuyahoga   | 44545        |    |
| 118. | Northeastern Local School District       | Clark      | 46250        |    |
| 119. | Northmont City School District           | Montgomery | 48728        |    |

## SECOND PHASE SCHOOL DISTRICTS WITH LEVIES<sup>3</sup>

*(Refer to footnote 3 definition on page 6)*

|      | School District Name                        | County     | District IRN |           |
|------|---|------------|--------------|-----------|
| 120. | Northwest Local School District             | Hamilton   | 47365        |           |
| 121. | Norton City School District                 | Summit     | 44552        |           |
| 122. | Norwalk City School District                | Huron      | 44560        |           |
| 123. | Oberlin City School District                | Lorain     | 44594        |           |
| 124. | Orrville City School District               | Wayne      | 44610        |           |
| 125. | Ottawa Hills School District                | Lucas      | 48215        |           |
| 126. | Ottawa-Glandorf Local School District       | Putnam     | 49379        |           |
| 127. | Painesville City School District            | Lake       | 44628        | <b>ii</b> |
| 128. | Pandora-Gilboa Local School District        | Putnam     | 49395        |           |
| 129. | Perrysburg Exempted Village School District | Wood       | 45583        |           |
| 130. | Poland Local School                         | Mahoning   | 48348        |           |
| 131. | Port Clinton City School District           | Ottawa     | 44651        |           |
| 132. | Reading Community City School District      | Hamilton   | 44693        |           |
| 133. | Richmond Heights Local School District      | Cuyahoga   | 46599        | <b>ii</b> |
| 134. | River Valley Local School District          | Marion     | 48447        |           |
| 135. | Riverside Local School District             | Lake       | 47894        |           |
| 136. | Rocky River City School District            | Cuyahoga   | 44701        |           |
| 137. | Rootstown Local School District             | Portage    | 49213        |           |
| 138. | Sandusky City School District               | Erie       | 44743        |           |
| 139. | Shawnee Local School                        | Allen      | 45799        |           |
| 140. | Shelby City School District                 | Richland   | 44776        |           |
| 141. | South Euclid-Lyndhurst City School District | Cuyahoga   | 44792        |           |
| 142. | South Range Local School                    | Mahoning   | 48363        |           |
| 143. | Spencerville Local School District          | Allen      | 45807        |           |
| 144. | Springfield Local School District           | Mahoning   | 48371        |           |
| 145. | Stow-Munroe Falls City School District      | Summit     | 44834        |           |
| 146. | Strasburg-Franklin Local School District    | Tuscarawas | 50294        |           |
| 147. | Strongsville City School District           | Cuyahoga   | 44842        |           |
| 148. | Switzerland of Ohio Local School District   | Monroe     | 48652        |           |
| 149. | Tallmadge City School District              | Summit     | 44883        |           |
| 150. | Tecumseh Local School District              | Clark      | 46243        |           |
| 151. | Tiffin City School District                 | Seneca     | 44891        |           |
| 152. | Toledo Public School District               | Lucas      | 44909        | <b>ii</b> |
| 153. | Tri-County North Local School District      | Preble     | 91397        |           |
| 154. | Trimble Local School District               | Athens     | 45922        |           |
| 155. | Tri-Rivers Joint Vocational School District | Marion     | 65268        | <b>i</b>  |
| 156. | Triway Local School District                | Wayne      | 50591        |           |

## SECOND PHASE SCHOOL DISTRICTS WITH LEVIES<sup>3</sup>

*(Refer to footnote 3 definition on page 6)*

|      | School District Name                        | County     | District IRN |           |
|------|---|------------|--------------|-----------|
| 157. | Tuscarawas Valley Local School District     | Tuscarawas | 50302        |           |
| 158. | Tuslaw Local School District                | Stark      | 49957        |           |
| 159. | Twinsburg City School District              | Summit     | 50070        |           |
| 160. | Upper Arlington City School District        | Franklin   | 44933        |           |
| 161. | Urbana City School District                 | Champaign  | 44941        |           |
| 162. | Valley View Local School District           | Montgomery | 48744        |           |
| 163. | Vandalia- Butler City School District       | Montgomery | 44958        |           |
| 164. | Vantage Career Center                       | Van Wert   | 51672        | <b>i</b>  |
| 165. | Walnut Township Local Schools               | Fairfield  | 46904        |           |
| 166. | Warren Local School District                | Washington | 50500        | <b>ii</b> |
| 167. | Waterloo Local School District              | Portage    | 49247        |           |
| 168. | Wellington Exempted Village School District | Lorain     | 45658        |           |
| 169. | West Carrollton City School District        | Montgomery | 45054        |           |
| 170. | West Clermont Local School District         | Clermont   | 46359        |           |
| 171. | West Geauga Local School District           | Gauga      | 47225        |           |
| 172. | West Holmes Local School District           | Holmes     | 47696        |           |
| 173. | West Liberty-Salem Local School District    | Champaign  | 46219        |           |
| 174. | West Muskingum Local School District        | Muskingum  | 48884        |           |
| 175. | Western Brown Local School District         | Brown      | 46060        |           |
| 176. | Willard City School District                | Huron      | 45096        | <b>ii</b> |
| 177. | Willoughby-Eastlake City School District    | Lake       | 45104        |           |
| 178. | Woodmore Local School District              | Sandusky   | 49577        |           |
| 179. | Woodridge Local School District             | Summit     | 49973        |           |
| 180. | Worthington City School District            | Franklin   | 45138        |           |
| 181. | Xenia Community City School District        | Greene     | 45153        |           |
| 182. | Yellow Springs Exempted School District     | Greene     | 45674        |           |
| 183. | Youngstown City School District             | Mahoning   | 45161        | <b>ii</b> |
| 184. | Zane Trace School Levy                      | Ross       | 49544        |           |

### 3.1. SECOND-PHASE LEVY SCHOOLS SELECTED FOR TESTING

For the second phase of the school attendance review, AOS selected the following schools with levies on the November 2012 ballot for testing using attendance data reported by schools to ODE for the 2010-11 school year:

| SECOND-PHASE LEVY SCHOOLS SELECTED FOR TESTING |              |                      |              |                            |             |                                     |  |  |   |                             |
|--|--------------|----------------------|--------------|----------------------------|-------------|-------------------------------------|--|--|---|-----------------------------|
|  | District IRN | School District Name | Building IRN | School Name                | County Name | State Roll Up Students <sup>4</sup> | Percent of State Roll Up Students <sup>5</sup> | Tested State Roll Up Students <sup>6</sup> | Percent of Tested State Roll Up Students <sup>7</sup> | Total Students <sup>8</sup> |
| 1.   | 43489        | Akron City           | 363          | Akron Alternative Academy  | Summit      | 209                                 | 43   | 145  | 29.8  | 486                         |
| 2.   | 43521        | Athens City          | 1149         | Athens High School         | Athens      | 114                                 | 12.6   | 68   | 7.5   | 907                         |
| 3.   | 43539        | Barberton City       | 16170        | Highland Middle School     | Summit      | 139                                 | 27.5   | 42   | 8.3   | 505                         |
| 4.   | 43539        | Barberton City       | 18457        | Johnson Elementary School  | Summit      | 151                                 | 36.9   | 33   | 8.1   | 409                         |
| 5.   | 43539        | Barberton City       | 24182        | Memorial Elementary School | Summit      | 111                                 | 28.5   | 17   | 4.4   | 389                         |
| 6.   | 46300        | Batavia Local        | 1693         | Batavia Elementary School  | Clermont    | 256                                 | 24.5   | 43   | 4.1   | 1044                        |
| 7.   | 46300        | Batavia Local        | 124859       | Batavia Middle School      | Clermont    | 154                                 | 20.6   | 67   | 9   | 748                         |
| 8.   | 47241        | Beavercreek City     | 34181        | Shaw Elementary School     | Greene      | 140                                 | 15.7   | 43   | 4.8   | 894                         |
| 9.   | 43570        | Bellaire Local       | 142513       | Bellaire Middle School     | Belmont     | 116                                 | 23.3   | 47   | 9.4   | 498                         |
| 10.  | 49692        | Bettsville Local     | 2626         | Bettsville High School     | Seneca      | 15                                  | 20.5   | 4  | 5.5   | 73                          |
| 11.  | 49692        | Bettsville Local     | 122077       | Bettsville Middle School   | Seneca      | 30                                  | 39   | 5  | 6.5   | 77                          |
| 12.  | 43638        | Bowling Green City   | 7773         | Crim Elementary School     | Wood        | 68                                  | 20.2   | 29   | 8.6   | 336                         |
| 13.  | 43638        | Bowling Green City   | 24950        | Milton Elementary School   | Wood        | 38                                  | 24.2   | 8  | 5.1   | 157                         |
| 14.  | 43638        | Bowling Green City   | 31625        | Ridge Elementary School    | Wood        | 41                                  | 22.7   | 15   | 8.3   | 181                         |
| 15.  | 43695        | Cambridge City       | 4622         | Cambridge High School      | Guernsey    | 197                                 | 22.6   | 58   | 6.7   | 871                         |
| 16.  | 43695        | Cambridge City       | 4614         | Cambridge Middle School    | Guernsey    | 110                                 | 17.2   | 31   | 4.9   | 638                         |
| 17.  | 47829        | Centerburg Local     | 187          | Centerburg Middle School   | Knox        | 25                                  | 9.3  | 9  | 3.3   | 270                         |

<sup>4</sup> This is the number of SSID's rolled up to the State's attendance rate in the report card.

<sup>5</sup> This is the percentage of SSID's rolled up to the State's attendance rate in the report card.

<sup>6</sup> This is the number of SSID's that had at least one assessment test record and were rolled up to the State's attendance rate in the report card.

<sup>7</sup> This is the percentage of SSID's that had at least one assessment test record and were rolled up to the State's attendance rate in the report card.

<sup>8</sup> This is the number of unique SSID's reported by the school, which includes any student that was present in the school for any length of time during the school year (which may not have been a period long enough to be included in the report card for Accountability purposes).

**SECOND-PHASE LEVY SCHOOLS SELECTED FOR TESTING**

|     | <b>District IRN</b> | <b>School District Name</b> | <b>Building IRN</b> | <b>School Name</b>                | <b>County Name</b> | <b>State Roll Up Students<sup>4</sup></b> | <b>Percent of State Roll Up Students<sup>5</sup></b> | <b>Tested State Roll Up Students<sup>6</sup></b> | <b>Percent of Tested State Roll Up Students<sup>7</sup></b> | <b>Total Students<sup>8</sup></b> |
|-----|---------------------|-----------------------------|---------------------|-----------------------------------|--------------------|---|--|--|---|-----------------------------------|
| 18. | 43737               | Centerville City            | 27342               | Normandy Elementary School        | Montgomery         | 72  | 12.3   | 27   | 4.6   | 586                               |
| 19. | 43752               | Cincinnati City             | 32797               | Rothenberg Preparatory Academy    | Hamilton           | 143                                       | 34.3   | 51   | 12.2  | 417                               |
| 20. | 48488               | Cloverleaf Local            | 34041               | Cloverleaf Elementary School      | Medina             | 54  | 12.8   | 32   | 7.6   | 422                               |
| 21. | 49999               | Coventry Local              | 19638               | Erwine Intermediate School        | Summit             | 59  | 17   | 19   | 5.5   | 348                               |
| 22. | 49189               | Crestwood Local             | 89680               | Crestwood/Larlham                 | Portage            | 13  | 92.9   | 10   | 71.4  | 14                                |
| 23. | 47027               | Dublin City                 | 99580               | Albert Chapman Elementary School  | Franklin           | 77  | 13.1   | 26   | 4.4   | 587                               |
| 24. | 47027               | Dublin City                 | 98475               | Ann Simpson Davis Middle School   | Franklin           | 96  | 10   | 93   | 9.7   | 963                               |
| 25. | 47027               | Dublin City                 | 99598               | Daniel Wright Elementary School   | Franklin           | 117                                       | 19.2   | 51   | 8.4   | 608                               |
| 26. | 47027               | Dublin City                 | 120485              | Dublin Scioto High School         | Franklin           | 132                                       | 9.9  | 81   | 6.1   | 1327                              |
| 27. | 47027               | Dublin City                 | 98483               | Griffith Thomas Elementary School | Franklin           | 101                                       | 14.4   | 37   | 5.3   | 700                               |
| 28. | 47027               | Dublin City                 | 17368               | Indian Run Elementary School      | Franklin           | 80  | 11.6   | 27   | 3.9   | 688                               |
| 29. | 47027               | Dublin City                 | 98491               | Wyandot Elementary School         | Franklin           | 104                                       | 16   | 43   | 6.6   | 651                               |
| 30. | 47845               | East Knox Local             | 2808                | East Knox Elementary School       | Knox               | 100                                       | 14.4   | 17   | 2.4   | 694                               |
| 31. | 47795               | Edison Local                | 18218               | Edison High School                | Jefferson          | 135                                       | 17.8   | 25   | 3.3   | 757                               |
| 32. | 47795               | Edison Local                | 35493               | Edison Jr. High School            | Jefferson          | 31  | 10.2   | 5  | 1.7   | 303                               |
| 33. | 47795               | Edison Local                | 18374               | John E Gregg Elementary School    | Jefferson          | 97  | 25.2   | 7  | 1.8   | 385                               |
| 34. | 47795               | Edison Local                | 30296               | Pleasant Hill Elementary School   | Jefferson          | 73  | 20.5   | 5  | 1.4   | 356                               |
| 35. | 47795               | Edison Local                | 35790               | Stanton Elementary School         | Jefferson          | 191                                       | 26.6   | 18   | 2.5   | 717                               |
| 36. | 43943               | Elyria City                 | 12369               | Franklin Elementary School        | Lorain             | 130                                       | 23.9   | 30   | 5.5   | 543                               |
| 37. | 49775               | Fairlawn Local              | 11163               | Fairlawn High School              | Shelby             | 63  | 16.8   | 31   | 8.3   | 374                               |
| 38. | 44016               | Fremont City                | 39354               | Washington Elementary School      | Sandusky           | 66  | 29.5   | 12   | 5.4   | 224                               |
| 39. | 49619               | Green Local                 | 14373               | Green High School                 | Scioto             | 88  | 26.3   | 15   | 4.5   | 334                               |
| 40. | 48751               | Huber Heights City          | 19257               | Kitty Hawk Elementary School      | Montgomery         | 113                                       | 25.5   | 10   | 2.3   | 444                               |
| 41. | 48751               | Huber Heights City          | 37317               | Lamendola Elementary School       | Montgomery         | 105                                       | 18.1   | 33   | 5.7   | 581                               |
| 42. | 48686               | Jefferson Township Local    | 2824                | Blairwood Elementary School       | Montgomery         | 79  | 29.8   | 21   | 7.9   | 265                               |
| 43. | 47985               | Johnstown-Monroe Local      | 18473               | Willis C Adams Middle School      | Licking            | 23  | 5.2  | 9  | 2   | 440                               |

**SECOND-PHASE LEVY SCHOOLS SELECTED FOR TESTING**

|     | <b>District IRN</b> | <b>School District Name</b> | <b>Building IRN</b> | <b>School Name</b>                       | <b>County Name</b> | <b>State Roll Up Students<sup>4</sup></b> | <b>Percent of State Roll Up Students<sup>5</sup></b> | <b>Tested State Roll Up Students<sup>6</sup></b> | <b>Percent of Tested State Roll Up Students<sup>7</sup></b> | <b>Total Students<sup>8</sup></b> |
|-----|---------------------|-----------------------------|---------------------|--|--------------------|---|--|--|---|-----------------------------------|
| 44. | 48009               | Licking Heights Local       | 67868               | Licking Heights Central                  | Licking            | 117                                       | 14.1   | 45   | 5.4   | 829                               |
| 45. | 48009               | Licking Heights Local       | 20461               | Licking Heights High School              | Licking            | 150                                       | 16.2   | 74   | 8   | 926                               |
| 46. | 44222               | Lima City                   | 472                 | Liberty Arts Magnet K-8                  | Allen              | 154                                       | 37.7   | 14   | 3.4   | 409                               |
| 47. | 44222               | Lima City                   | 35097               | Lima South Science-Technology Magnet K-8 | Allen              | 189                                       | 39.5   | 44   | 9.2   | 479                               |
| 48. | 44222               | Lima City                   | 40576               | Lima West Middle School                  | Allen              | 197                                       | 37.1   | 32   | 6   | 531                               |
| 49. | 44222               | Lima City                   | 8296                | Progressive Academy                      | Allen              | 188                                       | 35.3   | 52   | 9.8   | 533                               |
| 50. | 44263               | Lorain City                 | 10208               | Academic Enrichment Academy              | Lorain             | 243                                       | 34.1   | 139  | 19.5  | 713                               |
| 51. | 44297               | Mansfield City              | 22301               | Mansfield Middle School                  | Richland           | 212                                       | 35   | 41   | 6.8   | 606                               |
| 52. | 44297               | Mansfield City              | 27078               | Newman Elementary School                 | Richland           | 236                                       | 47.9   | 7  | 1.4   | 493                               |
| 53. | 44354               | Massillon City              | 10488               | Emerson Elementary School                | Stark              | 47  | 25   | 10   | 5.3   | 188                               |
| 54. | 44388               | Medina City                 | 11707               | Evolve Academy                           | Medina             | 7   | 50   | 3  | 21.4  | 14                                |
| 55. | 44420               | Mount Vernon City           | 8029                | Dan Emmett Elementary School             | Knox               | 86  | 22.8   | 27   | 7.1   | 378                               |
| 56. | 44420               | Mount Vernon City           | 61465               | Pleasant Street Elementary School        | Knox               | 138                                       | 23.2   | 25   | 4.2   | 596                               |
| 57. | 47365               | Northwest Local             | 64683               | Northwest High School                    | Hamilton           | 151                                       | 13.4   | 64   | 5.7   | 1126                              |
| 58. | 47365               | Northwest Local             | 43315               | Pleasant Run Middle School               | Hamilton           | 122                                       | 14.1   | 64   | 7.4   | 868                               |
| 59. | 47365               | Northwest Local             | 36921               | Taylor Elementary School                 | Hamilton           | 109                                       | 19.7   | 24   | 4.3   | 554                               |
| 60. | 44594               | Oberlin City                | 28399               | Oberlin High School                      | Lorain             | 41  | 10.3   | 20   | 5   | 398                               |
| 61. | 49213               | Rootstown Local             | 32599               | Rootstown Elementary School              | Portage            | 87  | 13.3   | 24   | 3.7   | 652                               |
| 62. | 91397               | Tri-County North Local      | 37697               | Tri-County North High School             | Preble             | 46  | 12.6   | 14   | 3.8   | 365                               |
| 63. | 45922               | Trimble Local               | 37556               | Trimble Elementary School                | Athens             | 96  | 21.9   | 14   | 3.2   | 438                               |
| 64. | 45922               | Trimble Local               | 13755               | Trimble High School                      | Athens             | 37  | 12.8   | 24   | 8.3   | 289                               |
| 65. | 50070               | Twinsburg City              | 136101              | Twinsburg High School                    | Summit             | 98  | 6.8  | 68   | 4.7   | 1440                              |
| 66. | 45054               | West Carrollton City        | 16584               | C F Holliday Elementary School           | Montgomery         | 116                                       | 23.9   | 38   | 7.8   | 486                               |
| 67. | 45054               | West Carrollton City        | 27219               | Frank Nicholas Elementary School         | Montgomery         | 36  | 16.7   | 10   | 4.7   | 215                               |
| 68. | 45054               | West Carrollton City        | 33027               | Harry Russell Elementary School          | Montgomery         | 93  | 21.7   | 31   | 7.2   | 429                               |



| SECOND-PHASE LEVY SCHOOLS SELECTED FOR TESTING |              |                      |              |  |             |                                     |  |  |   |                             |
|--|--------------|----------------------|--------------|--|-------------|-------------------------------------|--|--|---|-----------------------------|
|  | District IRN | School District Name | Building IRN | School Name                              | County Name | State Roll Up Students <sup>4</sup> | Percent of State Roll Up Students <sup>5</sup> | Tested State Roll Up Students <sup>6</sup> | Percent of Tested State Roll Up Students <sup>7</sup> | Total Students <sup>8</sup> |
| 69.  | 45054        | West Carrollton City | 38588        | West Carrollton High School              | Montgomery  | 227                                 | 17.9   | 116  | 9.2   | 1266                        |
| 70.  | 46359        | West Clermont Local  | 89565        | Holly Hill Elementary School             | Clermont    | 72                                  | 14.9   | 23   | 4.8   | 482                         |
| 71.  | 46359        | West Clermont Local  | 41897        | Withamsville-Tobasco Elementary School   | Clermont    | 113                                 | 18.3   | 25   | 4.1   | 616                         |
| 72.  | 46060        | Western Brown Local  | 14886        | Hamersville Elementary School            | Brown       | 220                                 | 26.5   | 30   | 3.6   | 830                         |
| 73.  | 46060        | Western Brown Local  | 25866        | Western Brown High School                | Brown       | 216                                 | 18.3   | 47   | 4   | 1180                        |
| 74.  | 45096        | Willard City         | 31559        | Richmond Elementary School               | Huron       | 25                                  | 16.4   | 14   | 9.2   | 152                         |
| 75.  | 49973        | Woodridge Local      | 123034       | Woodridge Intermediate Elementary School | Summit      | 83                                  | 16.4   | 33   | 6.5   | 507                         |
| 76.  | 45138        | Worthington City     | 3822         | Brookside Elementary School              | Franklin    | 30                                  | 9.1  | 8  | 2.4   | 330                         |
| 77.  | 45138        | Worthington City     | 42275        | Worthington Estates Elementary School    | Franklin    | 63                                  | 11.4   | 27   | 4.9   | 553                         |
| 78.  | 45138        | Worthington City     | 98087        | Worthington Park Elementary School       | Franklin    | 66                                  | 13.5   | 40   | 8.2   | 488                         |
| 79.  | 45153        | Xenia Community City | 18838        | Simon Kenton Elementary School           | Greene      | 150                                 | 30   | 18   | 3.6   | 500                         |
| 80.  | 45161        | Youngstown City      | 342          | Youngstown Virtual Academy               | Mahoning    | 59                                  | 51.3   | 35   | 30.4  | 115                         |
| 81.  | 49544        | Zane Trace Local     | 42572        | Zane Trace High School                   | Ross        | 93                                  | 15.2   | 24   | 3.9   | 613                         |

#### 4. SECOND-PHASE LEVY SCHOOLS SUMMARY OF TESTING RESULTS

---

The following is a summary of AOS testing results over enrollment for the 2010-11 school year on selected second-phase levy schools. Of the 81 school buildings tested, none were found to have evidence of scrubbing; 20 were found to have sporadic errors, and 53 had no errors. Testing for the remaining eight school districts was indeterminate. These testing results are as of this report date.

##### 4.1. SECOND-PHASE LEVY SCHOOL WITH EVIDENCE OF SCRUBBING

---

Of the second-phase levy schools selected for testing, none were found to have evidence of scrubbing identified during the 2010-11 school year.

##### 4.2. SECOND-PHASE LEVY SCHOOLS WITH ERRORS

---

The following table describes the schools with less pervasive errors in enrollment identified during the

2010-11 school year for second-phase levy schools. For purposes of this report, “errors” are defined as sporadic exceptions including, but not limited to, a lack of documentation, missing student files, and incorrect or unsubstantiated EMIS withdraw codes.

Also, during our testing of the selected second-phase levy schools for the 2010-11 school year, we found Normandy Elementary School at Centerville City School District (CSD) was missing enrollment documentation for 17 out of 27 student files tested. Centerville CSD contracts with a data warehouse to copy certain student records to microfilm and destroy hard copies of student files upon a student’s withdrawal from the school district. Each October, the data warehouse collects student files for Centerville CSD students that withdrew or graduated during the previous school year. The data warehouse microfilms certain items from the student files and remits the microfilm to the District. The data warehouse then destroys all of the remaining hard copies from the withdrawn or graduated student files. Allegedly, the student files maintained for withdrawn and graduated students is determined via a written agreement between the school district and data warehouse; however, the school district has not yet provided a copy of this agreement to AOS. The school district informed AOS that it does not instruct the data warehouse to copy student withdrawal forms, enrollment forms, or requests for records to microfilm. (Additional information about the 17 errors is provided in the table below.)

Section 8310A, *Public Records*, of the Centerville CSD Administrative Guidelines requires student records including, but not limited to: enrollment and withdrawal information, grades, transcripts, and attendance records to be maintained permanently for five years. Additionally, Ohio Rev. Code §3317.031 requires student membership records be kept intact for at least **five** years and shall be made available to the State Board of Education or its representative in making an audit of the average daily membership or the transportation of the district.

| SECOND PHASE LEVY SCHOOLS WITH ERRORS |              |                      |                            |   |   |  |
|---------------------------------------|--------------|----------------------|----------------------------|---|---|--|
|                                       | District IRN | School District Name | School Name                | AOS Sample Size for Tested State Roll Up Students | Issues Identified to Date<br>(See notes for additional information) | Results / Status   |
| 1.                                    | 001149       | Athens CSD           | Athens High School         | 30  | 4   | 4 – Improper withdraw codes based on student file documentation.   |
| 2.                                    | 043638       | Bowling Green LSD    | Ridge Elementary           | 15  | 1   | 1 – The student was coded as withdrawing under code “46” (transferred out of the United States). There was no documentation in the student’s file supporting a withdrawal and moving out of the Country. We did see documents showing the student originally came from Canada to the US. Per EMIS Coordinator, parents never came in to formally withdraw student, students just never returned to the district. |
| 3.                                    | 047829       | Centerburg LSD       | Centerburg Middle School   | 9   | 3   | 2 - No admission form in file or records release request was noted in the file to support admission date.<br>1 - No documentation was maintained that the student withdrew. However, able to confirm student was home schooled from list provided by Knox County Educational Service Center.   |
| 4.                                    | 043737       | Centerville CSD      | Normandy Elementary School | 27  | 17  | 1 - The District was not able to provide AoS with support that this student was an LEP student. AoS was not able to verify that the WKC code for this student was correct.<br><br>The District contracts with record destruction   |

**SECOND PHASE LEVY SCHOOLS WITH ERRORS**

|    | District IRN | School District Name | School Name                    | AOS Sample Size for Tested State Roll Up Students | Issues Identified to Date<br><i>(See notes for additional information)</i> | Results / Status  |
|----|--------------|----------------------|--------------------------------|---|--|---|
|    |              |                      |                                |   |  | <p>company to copy certain student records to film and then destroy the hard copies after students withdraw from the District. Each October, the company collects student files for all students who were withdrawn or graduated during the prior school year. The company copies certain items from the folders to film and remit the film to the District. They then destroy all of the hard copies. The District does not instruct the company to put student withdrawal forms, enrollment forms, or requests for records on film. They are all destroyed. As a result, the following errors were noted:</p> <p>7 - The District was not able to provide an enrollment form completed and signed by a parent nor were they able to provide a Request for Records for records requested from the prior district.</p> <p>1 - The District was not able to provide the second page of one student's enrollment form (page signed by a parent).</p> <p>6 - The District was not able to provide a withdrawal form completed and signed by a parent nor were they able to provide a Request for Records from the receiving district.</p> <p>2 - The District was not able to provide enrollment or withdrawal forms completed and signed by a parent, nor were they able to provide any Request for Records. Further, the District was not able to provide support that these students were LEP students.</p> |
| 5. | 043752       | Cincinnati CSD       | Rothenberg Preparatory Academy | 30  | 1  | 1 - Student was withdrawn with a subsequent re-enrollment noted as inactivated in error by the District. There was no enrollment form or other documentation to support the dates entered.  |

**SECOND PHASE LEVY SCHOOLS WITH ERRORS**

|    | District IRN | School District Name   | School Name                     | AOS Sample Size for Tested State Roll Up Students | Issues Identified to Date<br>(See notes for additional information) | Results / Status   |
|----|--------------|------------------------|---------------------------------|---|---|--|
| 6. | 047027       | Dublin CSD             | Daniel Wright Elementary School | 30  | 3   | <p>1 – The withdrawal code used was 74 (Moved not known to be continuing), however, the District received records request from new school during the school year; therefore, the District should have updated withdrawal code to 41 (transferred to another Ohio School District Local, Exempted Village, or City, transcript request on file)</p> <p>1 – Withdrawal code used was 42 (transferred to a private school, transcript request on file) for a student who transferred to a school that is in a Public School System; therefore, withdrawal code 41 (transferred to another Ohio School District Local, Exempted Village, or City, transcript request on file) should have been used.</p> <p>1 – Withdrawal code used was 40 (transferred to another school district outside of Ohio, transcript request on file) for a student who actually transferred outside the United States; therefore, withdrawal code 46 (transferred out of the United States) should have been used.</p> |
| 7. | 047027       | Dublin CSD             | Indian Run Elementary School    | 27  | 2   | <p>2 – The withdrawn code used was 74 (Moved not known to be continuing), however, the District received records request from new school; therefore, the District should have updated withdrawn code to 41 (transferred to another Ohio School District Local, Exempted Village, or City, transcript request on file)</p>  |
| 8. | 002824       | Jefferson Township LSD | Blairwood Elementary School     | 21  | 4   | <p>2 - Student files could not be located</p> <p>1 - Student with no withdrawal paperwork contained in file to support withdrawal date or code</p> <p>1 - Student with DASL paperwork contained in file indicating that student is a resident foster placed elsewhere full time effective 7/1/10. However, no supporting documentation contained in file to support withdrawal. Additional DASL paperwork indicating the student is attending ESC full time effective 1/3/11. However, no supporting documentation contained in file to support withdrawal.</p>  |
| 9. | 048009       | Licking Heights LSD    | High School                     | 74  | 2   | <p>1 - The Withdrawal code was 41 – transfer to another Ohio school District; The correct code should have been 99 – Completed HS Graduation Requirements</p> <p>1 – The parent fill out a withdrawal form on 1/15 for a vacation out of the country for the</p>   |

**SECOND PHASE LEVY SCHOOLS WITH ERRORS**

|     | District IRN | School District Name | School Name                              | AOS Sample Size for Tested State Roll Up Students | Issues Identified to Date<br>(See notes for additional information) | Results / Status  |
|-----|--------------|----------------------|--|---|---|---|
|     |              |                      |  |   |   | student for two weeks in February   |
| 10. | 044222       | Lima CSD             | Liberty Arts Magnet k-8                  | 14  | 2   | Two students who attend Marimor moved from Delphos to Lima City. They never attended Lima City, per inquiry with the EMIS coordinator. There was no paperwork in student files to support dates, this is usually done with a phone call   |
| 11. | 044222       | Lima CSD             | Lima South Science-Technology Magnet K-8 | 30  | 1   | One student file was selected which contained no support for the students re-enrollment in the district   |
| 12. | 044222       | Lima CSD             | Progressive Academy                      | 30  | 1   | Per EMIS coordinator, they don't get documentation when a student goes to the adult jail. Per the EMIS coordinator, code 45 and 48 are next to each other and just entered the wrong code.  |
| 13. | 044420       | Mount Vernon CSD     | Pleasant Street Elementary               | 25  | 3   | 1 - Noted that documentation supported withdrawal date but not code. Student was improperly coded as moving to another district in state, 41, when documentation shows student moving out of state, 40.<br>1 – Noted record request from another district in Ohio that did not include date to support the withdrawal date.<br>1 – Noted student re-enrolled in district after attending digital academy but no admission forms were completed.<br>There were eight files whereby no withdrawal form was present; however other documentation was maintained in file to support the attendance event. |
| 14. | 044594       | Oberlin CSD          | Oberlin High School                      | 20  | 1   | One student rolled up was enrolled at JVS however this was not an open enrolled JVS; therefore, the JVS student should not have been withdrawn.   |
| 15. | 045054       | West Carrollton CSD  | Harry Russell Elementary School          | 30  | 1   | 1 - Student record was unable to be located.  |
| 16. | 045054       | West Carrollton CSD  | West Carrollton High School              | 30  | 1   | 1 - Student file had no evidence in the file indicating that the student withdrew. There was also no indication that the school attempted to locate the student   |
| 17. | 046359       | West Clermont LSD    | Holly Hill Elementary                    | 23  | 1   | 1 – There was no enrollment form or other documentation for school year 2010-2011 to support enrollment.  |
| 18. | 045096       | Willard CSD          | Richmond Elementary School               | 14  | 1   | 1 – Student withdrawn 11/08/10 using withdrawal code “40” (Transferred to Another School District Outside of Ohio). Documentation could not be located supporting student withdrawal. Discussion with the EMIS Coordinator indicated student was part of migrant services and it is believed parents moved without notifying the District. Student was withdrawn after a number of consecutive days absent and failed attempts to contact parents (was not deemed truant).  |

| SECOND PHASE LEVY SCHOOLS WITH ERRORS |              |                      |                             |   |   |  |
|---------------------------------------|--------------|----------------------|-----------------------------|---|---|--|
|                                       | District IRN | School District Name | School Name                 | AOS Sample Size for Tested State Roll Up Students | Issues Identified to Date<br>(See notes for additional information) | Results / Status   |
| 19.                                   | 045138       | Worthington CSD      | Brookside Elementary        | 8   | 1   | 1 – The student was withdrawn on 4/15/11 using withdrawal code “46” (transferred out of the United States). Per review of the student’s file, there was no documentation to support that the student left the country.   |
| 20.                                   | 045138       | Worthington CSD      | Worthington Park Elementary | 40  | 7   | 2 – The District was unable to locate the student files.<br>3 – Withdrawn due to transfer to a private school (code “42”), however, records requests from subsequent schools indicated they transferred to other Ohio public schools.<br>1 – There was no support for the enrollment date in the student’s file.<br>1 – The student was withdrawn on 9/9/10 using the withdrawal code “74” (moved – not known to be continuing), however, a records request in the student file indicated the student transferred to another Ohio public school. |

### 4.3. SECOND-PHASE LEVY SCHOOLS FOUND TO BE CLEAN

The following table describes second-phase levy schools with no errors in enrollment identified during the 2010-11 school year.

| CLEAN SCHOOLS |              |                      |                            |   |   |                  |
|---------------|--------------|----------------------|----------------------------|---|---|------------------|
|               | District IRN | School District Name | School Name                | AOS Sample Size for Tested State Roll Up Students | Issues Identified to Date<br>(See notes for additional information) | Results / Status |
| 21.           | 043539       | Barberton CSD        | Highland Middle School     | 30  | 0   | Clean            |
| 22.           | 043539       | Barberton CSD        | Johnson Elementary School  | 33  | 0   | Clean            |
| 23.           | 043539       | Barberton CSD        | Memorial Elementary School | 17  | 0   | Clean            |
| 24.           | 046300       | Batavia LSD          | Batavia Elementary School  | 30  | 0   | Clean            |
| 25.           | 046300       | Batavia LSD          | Batavia Middle School      | 30  | 0   | Clean            |
| 26.           | 047241       | Beavercreek CSD      | Shaw Elementary            | 30  | 0   | Clean            |
| 27.           | 043570       | Bellaire LSD         | Bellaire Middle School     | 30  | 0   | Clean            |
| 28.           | 049692       | Bettsville LSD       | Bettsville High School     | 4   | 0   | Clean            |

**CLEAN SCHOOLS**

|     | <b>District IRN</b> | <b>School District Name</b> | <b>School Name</b>                | <b>AOS Sample Size for Tested State Roll Up Students</b> | <b>Issues Identified to Date<br/>(See notes for additional information)</b> | <b>Results / Status</b> |
|-----|---------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------------------------|--|---|-------------------------|
| 29. | 049692              | Bettsville LSD              | Bettsville Middle School          | 5  | 0   | Clean                   |
| 30. | 043638              | Bowling Green LSD           | Crim Elementary                   | 29   | 0   | Clean                   |
| 31. | 043638              | Bowling Green LSD           | Milton Elementary                 | 8  | 0   | Clean                   |
| 32. | 043695              | Cambridge CSD               | High School                       | 58   | 0   | Clean                   |
| 33. | 043695              | Cambridge CSD               | Middle School                     | 31   | 0   | Clean                   |
| 34. | 048488              | Cloverleaf LSD              | Cloverleaf Elementary School      | 32   | 0   | Clean                   |
| 35. | 049999              | Coventry LSD                | Erwine Intermediate School        | 19   | 0   | Clean                   |
| 36. | 049189              | Crestwood LSD               | Crestwood/Larham                  | 10   | 0   | Clean                   |
| 37. | 047027              | Dublin CSD                  | Albert Chapman Elementary School  | 26   | 0   | Clean                   |
| 38. | 047027              | Dublin CSD                  | Ann Simpson Davis Middle School   | 30   | 0   | Clean                   |
| 39. | 047027              | Dublin CSD                  | Dublin Scioto High School         | 30   | 0   | Clean                   |
| 40. | 047027              | Dublin CSD                  | Griffith Thomas Elementary School | 30   | 0   | Clean                   |
| 41. | 047027              | Dublin CSD                  | Wyandot Elementary School         | 30   | 0   | Clean                   |
| 42. | 047845              | East Knox LSD               | East Knox Elementary School       | 17   | 0   | Clean                   |
| 43. | 047795              | Edison LSD                  | Edison High School                | 25   | 0   | Clean                   |
| 44. | 047795              | Edison LSD                  | Edison Junior High School         | 5  | 0   | Clean                   |
| 45. | 047795              | Edison LSD                  | John J. Gregg Elementary          | 7  | 0   | Clean                   |
| 46. | 047795              | Edison LSD                  | Pleasant Hills Elementary         | 5  | 0   | Clean                   |
| 47. | 047795              | Edison LSD                  | Stanton Elementary                | 18   | 0   | Clean                   |
| 48. | 043943              | Elyria CSD                  | Franklin Elementary School        | 30   | 0   | Clean                   |
| 49. | 049775              | Fairlawn LSD                | Fairlawn High School              | 31   | 0   | Clean                   |
| 50. | 044016              | Fremont CSD                 | Washington Elementary School      | 12   | 0   | Clean                   |
| 51. | 049619              | Green LSD                   | Green High School                 | 15   | 0   | Clean                   |
| 52. | 048751              | Huber Heights CSD           | Kitty Hawk Elementary             | 10   | 0   | Clean                   |
| 53. | 048751              | Huber Heights CSD           | Lamendola Elementary              | 30   | 0   | Clean                   |
| 54. | 047985              | Johnstown-Monroe LSD        | Willis C Adams Middle School      | 9  | 0   | Clean                   |
| 55. | 048009              | Licking Heights LSD         | Central                           | 45   | 0   | Clean                   |
| 56. | 044222              | Lima CSD                    | Lima West Middle School           | 30   | 0   | Clean                   |

**CLEAN SCHOOLS**

|     | <b>District IRN</b> | <b>School District Name</b>     | <b>School Name</b>               | <b>AOS Sample Size for Tested State Roll Up Students</b> | <b>Issues Identified to Date<br/>(See notes for additional information)</b> | <b>Results / Status</b> |
|-----|---------------------|---------------------------------|----------------------------------|--|---|-------------------------|
| 57. | 044297              | Mansfield CSD                   | Mansfield Middle School          | 30   | 0   | Clean                   |
| 58. | 044297              | Mansfield CSD                   | Newman Elementary School         | 7  | 0   | Clean                   |
| 59. | 044388              | Medina CSD                      | Evolve Academy                   | 3  | 0   | Clean                   |
| 60. | 044420              | Mount Vernon CSD                | Dan Emmett Elementary            | 27   | 0   | Clean                   |
| 61. | 047365              | Northwest LSD                   | Northwest High School            | 30   | 0   | Clean                   |
| 62. | 047365              | Northwest LSD                   | Pleasant Run Middle School       | 30   | 0   | Clean                   |
| 63. | 047365              | Northwest LSD                   | Taylor Elementary                | 24   | 0   | Clean                   |
| 64. | 091397              | Tri-County North LSD            | Tri-County North High School     | 14   | 0   | Clean                   |
| 65. | 045922              | Trimble LSD                     | Trimble Elementary School        | 14   | 0   | Clean                   |
| 66. | 045922              | Trimble LSD                     | Trimble High School              | 24   | 0   | Clean                   |
| 67. | 050070              | Twinsburg CSD                   | Twinsburg High School            | 30   | 0   | Clean                   |
| 68. | 045054              | West Carrollton CSD             | C F Holliday Elementary School   | 30   | 0   | Clean                   |
| 69. | 045054              | West Carrollton CSD             | Frank Nicholas Elementary School | 10   | 0   | Clean                   |
| 70. | 046359              | West Clermont LSD               | Withamsville-Tobasco Elementary  | 25   | 0   | Clean                   |
| 71. | 045138              | Worthington CSD                 | Worthington Estates Elementary   | 27   | 0   | Clean                   |
| 72. | 045153              | Xenia Community School District | Simon Kenton Elementary          | 18   | 0   | Clean                   |
| 73. | 049544              | Zane Trace LSD                  | Zane Trace High School           | 24   | 0   | Clean                   |



**4.4. INDETERMINATE SECOND-PHASE LEVY SCHOOLS**

The following table describes the second-phase levy schools where enrollment testing for the 2010-11 school year is still indeterminate due to factors outside AOS control (e.g., schools are still gathering student information files and other information to support enrollment) as of the date of this report.

| INDETERMINATE SCHOOLS |              |                      |  |   |   |                  |
|-----------------------|--------------|----------------------|--|---|---|------------------|
|                       | District IRN | School District Name | School Name                              | AOS Sample Size for Tested State Roll Up Students | Issues Identified to Date<br>(See notes for additional information) | Results / Status |
| 74.                   | 43489        | Akron CSD            | Akron Alternative Academy                | Undetermined                                      | Undetermined  | Undetermined     |
| 75.                   | 44263        | Lorain CSD           | Academic Enrichment Academy              | Undetermined                                      | Undetermined  | Undetermined     |
| 76.                   | 44354        | Massillon CSD        | Emerson Elementary School                | Undetermined                                      | Undetermined  | Undetermined     |
| 77.                   | 49213        | Rootstown LSD        | Rootstown                                | Undetermined                                      | Undetermined  | Undetermined     |
| 78.                   | 046060       | Western Brown LSD    | Hamersville Elementary                   | Undetermined                                      | Undetermined  | Undetermined     |
| 79.                   | 046060       | Western Brown LSD    | Western Brown High School                | Undetermined                                      | Undetermined  | Undetermined     |
| 80.                   | 49973        | Woodridge LSD        | Woodridge Intermediate Elementary School | Undetermined                                      | Undetermined  | Undetermined     |
| 81.                   | 45161        | Youngstown CSD       | Youngstown Virtual Academy               | Undetermined                                      | Undetermined  | Undetermined     |

**5. SCHOOL DISTRICT EXCLUSION LIST**

The following table lists school districts AOS excluded from testing based on the relatively low percentage of tested students pushed to the state report card for the 2010-11 school year in comparison to other schools. Unlike the earlier sections of this report, this table includes both levy and non-levy school districts. AOS identified certain school districts for which all schools within the district were reasonably close to the mean number of tested students pushed to the State report card for all schools. Based on this analysis, AOS determined those districts with all school buildings in the bottom 25% of the “tested students pushed to the state percentage” category. There were 26 school districts that met these criteria and will be excluded from the scope of AOS student attendance testing due to the remote likelihood of significant errors in the number of tested students pushed to the state report card. See section 2 of this report for more information about the AOS exclusion criteria. School districts with levies on the November 2012 ballot are denoted with an asterisk (\*) in the table.

| SCHOOL DISTRICT EXCLUSION LIST |              |                      |                                     |  |  |   |                             |                             |
|--------------------------------|--------------|----------------------|-------------------------------------|--|--|---|-----------------------------|-----------------------------|
|                                | District IRN | School District Name | State Roll Up Students <sup>4</sup> | Percent of State Roll Up Students <sup>5</sup> | Tested State Roll Up Students <sup>6</sup> | Percent of Tested State Roll Up Students <sup>7</sup> | Total Students <sup>8</sup> | Asterisk (*) Indicates Levy |

**SCHOOL DISTRICT EXCLUSION LIST**

|     | <b>District IRN</b> | <b>School District Name</b>     | <b>State Roll Up Students<sup>4</sup></b> | <b>Percent of State Roll Up Students<sup>5</sup></b> | <b>Tested State Roll Up Students<sup>6</sup></b> | <b>Percent of Tested State Roll Up Students<sup>7</sup></b> | <b>Total Students<sup>8</sup></b> | <b>Asterisk (*) Indicates Levy</b> |
|-----|---------------------|---------------------------------|---|--|--|---|-----------------------------------|------------------------------------|
| 1.  | 045286              | Chagrin Falls Exempted Village  | 59  | 2.8%   | 20   | 1.0%  | 2,074                             |                                    |
| 2.  | 045310              | Coldwater Exempted Village      | 98  | 6.4%   | 12   | 0.8%  | 1,523                             |                                    |
| 3.  | 064964              | College Corner Local            | 39  | 29.5%  | 0  | 0.0%  | 132                               |                                    |
| 4.  | 046557              | Cuyahoga Heights                | 27  | 2.8%   | 14   | 1.4%  | 975                               |                                    |
| 5.  | 047050              | Evergreen Local                 | 86  | 6.0%   | 9  | 0.6%  | 1,422                             |                                    |
| 6.  | 049783              | Fort Loramie Local              | 67  | 7.5%   | 4  | 0.4%  | 899                               |                                    |
| 7.  | 048595              | Fort Recovery Local             | 53  | 4.7%   | 2  | 0.2%  | 1,132                             |                                    |
| 8.  | 046565              | Independence Local              | 51  | 4.4%   | 15   | 1.3%  | 1,161                             |                                    |
| 9.  | 045435              | Indian Hill Exempted Village    | 93  | 4.3%   | 27   | 1.2%  | 2,174                             |                                    |
| 10. | 049338              | Jennings Local                  | 63  | 14.2%  | 5  | 1.1%  | 443                               |                                    |
| 11. | 047191              | Kenston Local                   | 114                                       | 3.4%   | 42   | 1.3%  | 3,331                             |                                    |
| 12. | 047878              | Kirtland Local                  | 46  | 3.7%   | 7  | 0.6%  | 1,248                             | *                                  |
| 13. | 047449              | Liberty-Benton Local            | 191                                       | 13.3%  | 18   | 1.3%  | 1,433                             |                                    |
| 14. | 048330              | Lowellville Local               | 27  | 4.3%   | 11   | 1.7%  | 634                               |                                    |
| 15. | 048553              | Marion Local                    | 40  | 4.3%   | 9  | 1.0%  | 932                               |                                    |
| 16. | 049361              | Miller City-New Cleveland Local | 41  | 8.4%   | 5  | 1.0%  | 487                               |                                    |
| 17. | 045948              | Minster Local                   | 50  | 5.5%   | 4  | 0.4%  | 905                               |                                    |

| SCHOOL DISTRICT EXCLUSION LIST |              |                             |                                     |  |  |   |                             |                             |
|--------------------------------|--------------|-----------------------------|-------------------------------------|--|--|---|-----------------------------|-----------------------------|
|                                | District IRN | School District Name        | State Roll Up Students <sup>4</sup> | Percent of State Roll Up Students <sup>5</sup> | Tested State Roll Up Students <sup>6</sup> | Percent of Tested State Roll Up Students <sup>7</sup> | Total Students <sup>8</sup> | Asterisk (*) Indicates Levy |
| 18.                            | 045955       | New Bremen Local            | 61                                  | 6.6%   | 13   | 1.4%  | 918                         |                             |
| 19.                            | 045963       | New Knoxville Local         | 42                                  | 8.7%   | 5  | 1.0%  | 483                         |                             |
| 20.                            | 044586       | Oakwood City                | 83                                  | 3.7%   | 22   | 1.0%  | 2,250                       |                             |
| 21.                            | 046763       | Olentangy Local             | 363                                 | 2.2%   | 96   | 0.6%  | 16,734                      |                             |
| 22.                            | 048215       | Ottawa Hills Local          | 44                                  | 4.3%   | 16   | 1.6%  | 1,028                       | *                           |
| 23.                            | 049387       | Ottoville Local             | 42                                  | 8.0%   | 6  | 1.1%  | 522                         |                             |
| 24.                            | 048975       | Put-In-Bay Local            | 2                                   | 2.5%   | 0  | 0.0%  | 81                          |                             |
| 25.                            | 048363       | South Range Local           | 50                                  | 3.7%   | 18   | 1.3%  | 1,343                       | *                           |
| 26.                            | 048587       | St Henry Consolidated Local | 54                                  | 5.3%   | 9  | 0.9%  | 1,022                       |                             |

## **6. CONCLUSION**

---

As described throughout this report, the sheer complexity of the accountability system creates incentives for all schools and districts to improve indicators such as attendance, which could prove pivotal in the final outcome of their respective local report card rankings.

AOS will report the final status and results for all tested schools in its Final Report on Student Attendance Data and Accountability System. As part of this report, AOS will also provide recommendations for improved policies and procedures, and possible suggestions for legislative action.

## **7. VIEWS OF RESPONSIBLE SCHOOL OFFICIALS**

---

The schools for which testing was complete as of October 19, 2012 were provided an opportunity to respond to this report. Their responses were evaluated and changes were made to this report as AOS deemed necessary.

Responses to these comments can be obtained by contacting the school districts listed in section **4.2** of this report.



# Dave Yost • Auditor of State

## SECOND INTERIM REPORT ON STUDENT ATTENDANCE DATA AND ACCOUNTABILITY SYSTEM FRANKLIN COUNTY

### CLERK'S CERTIFICATION

This is a true and correct copy of the report which is required to be filed in the Office of the Auditor of State pursuant to Section 117.26, Revised Code, and which is filed in Columbus, Ohio.

*Susan Babbitt*

CLERK OF THE BUREAU

CERTIFIED  
OCTOBER 23, 2012